



INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION OF LIBRARY ASSOCIATIONS  
AND INSTITUTIONS  
WORLD LIBRARY AND INFORMATION CONGRESS

85<sup>th</sup> IFLA GENERAL CONFERENCE AND ASSEMBLY  
Athens, Greece  
24-30 AUGUST 2019

## Committee on Standards

### ISBD Review Group

<https://www.ifla.org/isbd-rg>

## MINUTES

### Meetings:

Tuesday 27, 10.45-13.15 (session 159, Business Meeting Room 1)

Thursday 29, 13.30-16.00 (session 266, Business Meeting Room 2)

Friday 30, 9.30-16.30, "ISBD-revision" full-day working meeting (Premises of the Friends of Music Society, Athens Concert Hall, MAICC) - not included in these minutes

**Attendees, members and liaisons:** Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (chair, IAML liaison), Gordon Dunsire (member, RDA Technical Team Liaison Officer, RDA Steering Committee), Elena Escolano Rodríguez (member), Mélanie Roche (member), Ricardo Santos Muñoz (member), Renate Behrens (liaison with the RDA Steering Committee), Vincent Boulet (member), Mikael Wetterstrom (member, ISSN Network liaison), Rehab Ouf (member), Saeedeh Akbari-Daryan (member), Flavia Bruni (member), Judi Fejes (member), Ben Gu (corresponding member), Irena Kavčič (corresponding member).

**Apologies:** Iman Khairy Weheba (member), Françoise Leresche (corresponding member), Mirna Willer (corresponding member).

**Representatives of other bodies and groups:** Diane Beattie (Committee on Standards Chair), Adelaida Caro Martín (Rare Books and Special Collections Section, liaison), Isabel Garcia-Monge (Rare Books and Special Collections Section), Agnese Galeffi (Cataloguing section communication officer, webmaster for the ISBD RG pages), Gordana Mazić (Permanent UNIMARC Committee chair), Chris Oliver (BCM Review Group Chair).

**Observers:** René du Grandlaunay (1<sup>st</sup> & 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting), Nikolista Christopoulos (1<sup>st</sup> meeting), Anthonia Onuoha (1<sup>st</sup> meeting), Gentil Pich (1<sup>st</sup> meeting), Jay Witz (1<sup>st</sup> meeting), Ana Vukadin, Yang Wang (1<sup>st</sup> & 2<sup>nd</sup> meetings), (Christian Alivert, Cataloguing Section).

### 1. Welcome and introductions

M. Gentili-Tedeschi welcomed the members, representatives of other bodies and groups, and observers.

### 2. Approval of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without amendments.

### 3. Approval of the Minutes of the ISBD RG Meetings, Kuala Lumpur 2018

[Minutes](#) were approved.

## 4. Membership

### 4.1. Incoming and outgoing members

This year was an election year. Nomination of new members used the Committee on Standards new *Procedures for Review Group nominations and elections of Chairs and members for the Review Groups*, which allowed the election of new members among the candidates before WLIC 2019. Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi thanked outgoing members, Susan R. Morris, Clément Oury and Vincent Boulet, for their years of excellent service and contribution to the work of the ISBD RG.

New nominations and renewals for 2019-2023 included: election of Gordon Dunsire, Mélanie Roche for a second term, and election of new members: Flavia Bruni, Hollie White, Judit Fejes, Rehab Ouf and Saeedeh Akbari-Daryan.

Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi reminded that he is leaving the ISBD RG this year for retirement. He warmly thanked all colleagues who shared with him a unique experience, either as a member of the RG or as a Chair for this roster of experts for two terms. The outgoing Chair was proposed to continue in the ISBD RG as a corresponding member, and accepted. Willer, Ben Gu and Irena Kavčič will continue as corresponding members and Dorothy McGarry as a honorary member.

Membership of the ISBD RG as of WLIC 2019 (Appendix IV)

### 4.2. Election of chair 2019-2021

The deadline for self-nomination for the position of chair of the ISBD RG 2019-2021 was 7 August 2019. To the date of the first Business Meeting no candidacies were received. Therefore, election of a chair was deferred to the Second Business Meeting, and the Committee on Standards was officially informed by the outgoing Chair about the decision. The outgoing Chair also informed CoS that, in search of a new chair, he would talk to potential candidates who fulfil the requirements among the current members of the ISBD Review Group. In Business Meeting II, Rehab Ouf, proposed by the outgoing Chair, was elected Chair by the members of the ISBD RG. Endorsement of the Chair by the Committee on Standards was to be done by email after WLIC 2019.

## 5. Matters arising from the Minutes of the Kuala Lumpur meeting and the Action List,

(version updated 2 August 2017). Specific topics to be discussed:

- 5.1. Check the existing mapping of compound terms from ISBD Area 0 Content form and Content qualification with ROF base categories, send to ISBD RG, CS SC and LIDATEC for comments and approval, publish (A. 1/18, G. Dunsire)

No change occurred.

- 5.2. Write an article about ISBD RG activities for the IFLA Metadata newsletter (A. 2/18, M. Roche)

No article was published, however the IEG 2018 Fall meeting and the ISBD Revision work was publicized in the RDA Steering Committee meeting.

- 5.3. Establish ISBD Editorial Group, organise meetings (see 7.1)
- 5.4. Organise extra whole-day meeting in Athens, Friday 30 August 2019 (see 10)
- 5.5. Organise nominations for new members (A. 9/18, M. Gentili-Tedeschi)

The election process for membership in the Review Groups followed the new procedure established by Committee on Standards, with the Review Groups chairs asked to provide each their specific criteria to be included in their call for nominations. The call for nominations for the ISBD RG for the term 2019-2023 was arranged by Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi, the justified recommendations were sent to CoS and the formal appointment was done by the Governing Board.

## 6. Chair's report

### 6.1. ISBD activity report

The *ISBD Revision* four-year work plan endorsed by the Committee on Standards entailed the request of funds to support the physical meetings required in the development work of the Revision. 2,000 euros were allocated by the Professional Committee for the meeting of the ISBD Editorial Group (IEG) in 2018; they were partially spent for the November meeting in Paris. The Governing Board has changed the procedures of funding the work of the Review Groups, by allotting the Committee on Standards 6,000 euros to support the development of IFLA Standards, to be distributed as the Committee sees relevant.

### 6.2. ISBD Review Group Activities Report, August 2018 – August 2019

M. Gentili-Tedeschi observed that the written report was sent to the Review Group members (Appendix II), and that a large part of it is practically covered in other points on the agenda; in order to leave as much time as possible to the discussion of the ISBD Revision.

### 6.3. Publications and presentations

The Romanian translation of the ISBD Consolidated edition has been published in 2019 bringing the number of languages in which the ISBD is available to 14.

## 7. Development of the standard: the ISBD Revision

### 7.1. Summary of the organisation of the ISBD Editorial Group (M. Gentili-Tedeschi)

ToR for the ISBD Editorial Group (IEG), drafted during WLIC 2018 Business Meetings, were approved and the Group established in 30 August 2018 with the following membership: Renate Behrens, Elena Escolano, Dorothy McGarry, Rehab Ouf, Clément Oury, Mélanie Roche (Chair).

The group met at the Bibliothèque nationale de France in Paris, 12-14 November 2018, worked on logistical, methodological and technical issues, including the selection of ISBD elements aligned with the LRM Manifestation statement attribute, the terminology and the use of punctuation<sup>1</sup>.

The IEG was reset in 25 May, following a decrease in membership, with as Chair Elena Escolano Rodriguez and as members: Renate Behrens, Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (observer), Dorothy McGarry, Rehab Ouf, Mikael Wetterstrom (ISSN International Centre Liaison, and Mirna Willer. The new group had only virtual meetings and focused on the content including extending the ISBD coverage to a larger array of resources.

### 7.2. Activities of the ISBD Editorial Group (E. Escolano Rodríguez)

The IEG worked from 25 May to WLIC 2019 virtually. To achieve progress, the IEG decided to postpone the controversial issues like the different views among the members on the ISBD – LRM alignment, and concentrate on studying the proposals received by different users communities to extend the ISBD to unpublished resources such as manuscripts, and proposals received since 2015 concerning cartographical resources.

During that period, liaisons were established with relevant entities within IFLA like Rare Books and Special Collections Section soliciting their input. The group also contacted libraries and concerned institutions to receive their comments on specific issues related to accessibility in catalogues and feedback on astronomical cartography proposals.

The IEG prepared a draft of ISBD including all proposals for change and revisions required to include unpublished resources to be debated and decided upon in the post WLIC 2019 daylong meeting of the IEG. The work done so far and the future plan were subject to a presentation by Elena Escolano Rodriguez in the Committee on Standards Open Session 142, *Recently Approved Standards - Committee on Standards Updates*.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Minutes: [https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/ieg\\_autumn\\_meeting\\_minutes\\_nov.2018.pdf](https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/ieg_autumn_meeting_minutes_nov.2018.pdf)

Preliminary recommendations: [https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/ieg\\_preliminary\\_recommendations.pdf](https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/ieg_preliminary_recommendations.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> Update ofn the work of the ISBD [https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/updateontheworkofisbdrevision\\_9-8-2019.pdf](https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/updateontheworkofisbdrevision_9-8-2019.pdf)

## 8. Reports of liaisons

### 8.1. Committee on Standards (D. Beattie)

The technical and advocacy efforts led by Committee on Standards (CoS) with and through its subcommittee LIDATEC were successfully concluded by the signature in August 2019 of the contract between IFLA and MMA for hosting and managing IFLA Standards namespaces.

For the next period, CoS will be concentrating its efforts on \*\* a proactive approach to the development of standards within IFLA, identifying the gaps and trying to incite professional units to develop relevant guidelines to fill them. CoS will also implement its communication strategy aiming at reaching at increasing the work of standards and guidelines within and beyond IFLA; the Review Groups are concerned with this communication strategy are primary stakeholders and will be involved in its implementation.

### 8.2. Cataloguing Section's Standing Committee (M. Säfström)

(Item will be updated later when the minutes will be published)

### 8.3. Rare Books and Special Collections Standing Committee (A. Caro Martín)

Adelaida Caro was appointed liaison from the Rare Books and Special Collections Section to the ISBD RG, per the ISBD Review Group request for a liaison between the 2 professional units to review the ISBD. For this a working group was established within the RBSCS to deal with cataloguing and metadata matters, and the activities of this working group were included in the Section's Action Plan. The working group started officially working with the reset IEG, focusing on the inclusion of Unpublished resources in the ISBD. Back in 2018, the RBSCS held a Knowledge Café on “Standards, guidelines and practices for rare materials cataloguing” at the WLIC 2018, and developed a survey on Rare Materials cataloguing with RDA. The results of the survey were published in February 2019, and demonstrated that the cataloguing of rare materials is carried out through RDA, ISBD or DCRM.

### 8.4. Linked Data Technical Sub-Committee (LIDATEC, A. Cato)

Rehab Ouf, CoS Liaison to LIDATEC reported that IFLA's contract with MMA was approved by IFLA HQ in conjunction with WLIC 2019. Anders Cato has resigned from his position as Chair and Joseph Hafner was elected new Chair of LIDATEC. The contract with Metadata Management Associates (MMA) on hosting and maintaining the IFLA Namespaces takes effect in November 2019 and lasts through December 2020. Joseph Hafner will lead the implementation of IFLA Namespaces with MMA and the IFLA Bib Standards Linked Data Study Group, taking into consideration the observations made by Gordon Dunsire, former chair of RSC, based on past work with MMA:

### 8.5. BCM Review Group (Ch. Oliver)

The BCM Review Group has a new Chair, Mélanie Roche from the Bibliothèque nationale de France. The LRMoo Working Group revising the object-oriented model FRBRoo, in collaboration with CIDOC, to transform it to LRMoo, had 3 physical meetings in Fall 2018, Spring and Summer 2019, where important decisions and many refinements were made. The LRMoo will change the methodology of numbering classes and properties equivalent to CIDOC CRM ones, not replicating them. Mapping is also under revision.

### 8.6. Permanent UNIMARC Committee (G. Mazić)

The permanent UNIMARC Committee had its 29<sup>th</sup> PUC Meeting in Maribor, Slovenia on 9–10 May 2019 with live streaming to interested audience. The Updates 2019 for UNIMARC, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. were published on 21<sup>st</sup> August 2019, few days before WLIC 2019, and a presentation by PUC Chair detailing the focus and content of the updates is planned in the Committee on Standards Open Session 142, *Recently Approved Standards - Committee on Standards Updates*.

### 8.7. RDA Steering Committee (R. Behrens)

On April, 30, 2019 the new RDA Toolkit was released in the English version; a main milestone in the RDA Restructuring and Redesign Project (3R Project). The old and new RDA Toolkits will co-exist during a transitional period, after which the new Toolkit will be the official representation of RDA. The RSC set up a working group for the RDA translators to keep up with related matters through

meetings, virtual conferences, and mailing-lists, as well as trainings on translation tools. A draft for a general application profile worked out by EURIG was submitted to the RSC in March 2019. The RSC will set up a special working group for this topic in the Fall 2019 based on EURIG proposal. New “task and finish working” groups will be set up for various matters including Application Profiles, music, and rare materials.

#### 8.8. ISSN Network (M. Wetterström)

Mikael Wetterstrom (ISSN International Centre Liaison) and Clément Oury (former ISSN IC Liaison) attended the IEG2018 Fall meeting. Mikael is member of the reset IEG. He worked with the Group starting from 25 May 2019. On the ISSN IC front, 2018-2019 activities had several highlights. The growing ISSN assignments to digital resources has reached 22,098 new online resources in 2018. A total of 213,807 records, new and modified, were processed for ingestion into the ISSN Register. The ISSN Review Group had 2 face-to-face meetings during the reporting period, and discussed among other topics harmonization between RDA, ISBD and ISSN and the policy of adding classifications in ISSN records. ISSN IC and ISO signed 2 Registration Authority Agreements entrusting the management and the implementation of ISO 4 and ISO 3297 to the ISSN International Centre.

#### 8.9. PRESSoo (M. Wetterström)

At IFLA, the ISSN International Centre continue to be represented in various sections and working groups. Deanna White is now ISSN IC Liaison to the PRESSoo Working Group. As extension of FRBRoo (the “object-oriented”, i.e. linked-data oriented, version of FRBR) and as a “formal ontology intended to capture and represent the underlying semantics of bibliographic information about continuing resources”, PRESSoo is of special importance to the ISSN IC, supporting the publishing of continuing resources bibliographic data in linked data. The model was used by the RDA Serials Task Force to update the RDA instructions related to serials.

#### 8.10. Linked Data Study Group (M. Roche)

The proposal to change the name and enlarge the scope of the ISBD Linked Data Study Group to be reflect a wider coverage of all IFLA bibliographic standards and their presentation as linked data has been endorsed by the Committee on Standards based on Terms of reference drafted by M. Roche. The group is now renamed Bibliographic Linked Data Study Group (Bib-LD SG) and chaired by Mélanie Roche. The Bib-LD SG will refer to LIDATEC; with membership from ISBD RG, the BCM RG, and the Permanent UNIMARC Committee. Elena Escolano Rodriguez and Mirna Willer were nominated representatives of the ISBD RG in the Bib-LD SG.

### **9. Relations with other international organizations and committees: updates from other projects and groups**

Nothing to report.

### **10. Full-day meeting, Friday 30 August 2019**

The ISBD Revision - post WLIC 2019 “full-day working meeting”, to take place in the Premises of the Friends of Music Society, Athens Concert Hall, MAICC was arranged by M. Gentili-Tedeschi, who initiated contact with the Society in Fall 2018. Elena Escolano Rodriguez, IEG Chair, presented in details the planned agenda of the day, stressing that it will be a working day for the IEG as well as members of ISBD RG and consulting liaisons around technical matters related to the ISBD Revision. This includes major content issues such as applying the extension proposals to the a draft, and ISBD – LRM alignment and possible structure derived from LRM. (detailed agenda attached)

### **11. ISBD RG at the WLIC 2019**

The Review Groups meetings at the IFLA annual congress are officially included in the official programme, raising the visibility, helping observers to attend the meetings, and facilitating programming the working activity.

The ISBD Review Group also presented in the Committee on Standards Open Session 142, *Recently Approved Standards - Committee on Standards Updates*. Elena Escolano Rodriguez, IEG Chair gave an

[Update on the Work of the ISBD Editorial Group](#), including a detailed background about the previous efforts leading to this work.

## **12. Any other businesses**

### 12.1. Information Coordinator and CATS Liaison

Ricardo Santos Muñoz was nominated Liaison with the Cataloguing Section and ISBD RG Information Coordinator.

### 12.2. Action Plan 2019-2020

Due to the limited time in the second Business Meeting, as the session was immediately preceding the WLIC 2019 closing session, the Action Plan 2019-2020 was not fully discussed. Some issues were also pending on how the Full-day meeting, Friday 30 August 2019 will develop. Therefore it was decided to finalize the plan in a Zoom meeting to be arranged by the incoming Chair, in early October in light of the outcomes of the full-day meeting.

#### Attachments:

1. ISBD RG Membership as of WLIC 2019 (the only one attached for now)

## **Appendix I: Membership of the ISBD Review Group as of WLIC 2019**

### **Nominations and continuations**

1. Flavia Bruni (Istituto Centrale per il Catalogo Unico, Roma, Italy: 1st term 2019-2023) Saeedeh Akbari-Daryan (National Library and Archives of Iran, Teheran, Islamic Republic of Iran: 1st term 2019-2023)
2. Elena Escolano Rodríguez (Biblioteca Central, Ministerio de Economía y Impresa, Madrid, Spain: 1st term 2017-2021)
3. Gordon Dunsire (Edinburgh, United Kingdom: 2nd term 2019-2023)
4. Hollie White (Curtin University, Perth, Australia: 1st term 2019-2023)
5. Iman Khairy Weheba (Qatar National Library, Doha, Qatar: 1st term 2017-2021)
6. Judit Fejes (National Széchényi Library, Budapest, Hungary: 1st term 2019-2023)
7. Mélanie Roche (Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris, France: 2nd term 2019-2023, Liaison with LIDATEC)
8. Rehab Ouf (Bibliotheca Alexandrina, Alexandria, Egypt: 1st term 2019-2023)
9. Renate Behrens (Deutsche Nationalbibliothek, Frankfurt am Main, Germany: 1st term 2017-2021, Liaison with the RDA Steering Committee)
10. Ricardo Santos Muñoz (National Library of Spain, Madrid, Spain: 2nd term 2017-2021)
11. Saeedeh Akbari-Daryan (National Library and Archives of Iran, Teheran, Islamic Republic of Iran: 1st term 2019-2023)

### **Honorary member**

12. Dorothy McGarry (Los Angeles, USA)

### **Corresponding members for 2019-2021**

13. Ben Gu (National library of China, Beijing, China)
14. Irena Kavčič (National and University Library, Ljubljana, Slovenia)
15. Françoise Leresche (Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris, France)
16. Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (IAML liaison)
17. Mirna Willer

### **Consulting liaisons**

18. Adelaida Caro Martín (Biblioteca Nacional de España, IFLA Rare Books and Special Collections Section)
19. Anders Cato (Katalogiseringsregler og bibliografisk standard for danske biblioteker)
20. Chris Holden (International Association of Music Libraries, archives and documentation centres)
21. Elena Ravelli (Commissione REICAT)
22. Mikael Wetterstrom (ISSN Network)
23. Regina Varnienė-Janssen (Kompiuterinių bibliografinių ir autoritetinių įrašų sudarymo metodika)
24. Takahiro Watanabe (Committee on Cataloging of the Japan Library Association)