



IFLA Review Group International Standard Bibliographic Description (ISBD)

INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION OF LIBRARY ASSOCIATIONS AND INSTITUTIONS
WORLD LIBRARY AND INFORMATION CONGRESS

87th IFLA GENERAL CONFERENCE AND ASSEMBLY
Dublin, Ireland
26-29 JULY 2022

ISBD Review Group

MINUTES

BM I: Thursday, July 28, 14:00 - 16:00 Dublin time (Ecocem)

Meetings:

ISBD Review Group

Closed meeting (ISBDM) – Wednesday, July 27, 8:30 – 10:30 (Ecocem)

[Business meeting I: Session 095](#)- Thursday, July 28, 14:00 - 16:00 (Ecocem)

Advisory Committee on Standards

[Business meeting I: Session 014](#) – Monday, July 25, 08:30 - 10:30 (Wicklow MR 5)

[Open Session 144](#) - International Standards for a Digital World, Thursday, July 28, 11:15 - 12:45, (Liffey Hall 1) (*ISBD RG presentation: ISBD: One standard, Two revision*)

Other relevant meetings

Cataloguing Section – SC I – Monday, July 25, 13:45 - 15:45 (Liffey Hall 2)

[Session 055](#) Quality Control for Metadata: What Does it Mean? - Tuesday, July 26, 11:00 - 12:15 (Liffey B)

BCM RG – Business meeting I – Wednesday, July 27, 15:30 - 17:30 (Wicklow MR 1)

PUC – Business meeting I – Wednesday, July 27, 13:15 - 15:15 (Ecocem)

LIDATEC – Business meeting I – Thursday, July 28, 08:30 - 10:30 (Wicklow Hall 1)

Attendees:

ISBD RG members and liaisons: Onsite: Renate Behrens (Chair of the Manifestation Task Force, RSC liaison), Mikael Wetterstrom (member, ISSN International Centre Liaison), Judit Fejes (member), Hyejin Kim (member), Isabel Garcia-Monge (IFLA RBSCS liaison), Ricardo Santos Muñoz (CATS liaison), Rehab Ouf (Chair of the ISBD RG)

Online: Elena Escolano Rodríguez (Chair of the Content Update Task Force), Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (corresponding member), Dorothy McGarry (honorary member), Saeedeh Akbari-Daryan (member), Flavia Bruni (member), Szabina Ilácsa (member)

Apologies:, Gordon Dunsire (member), Mirna Willer (corresponding member), Irena Kavčič (corresponding member)

Invitees & Observers: Pat Riva (Concordia University, CoS Secretary), Vincent Boulet (National Library of France, CATS Chair), Ahava Cohen (National Library of Israel, CATS), Anna Slawek (University of Toronto Canada, BIBS), Caroline Saccussi (Library of Congress, SAA), Branka Badovinac (IZUM, UNIMARC), Mihwa Lee (Kongju National University), Maria Micle (West University of Timisoara), Nathalie Cornic (ISSN International Centre), Jay Weitz (OCLC, BIBS) Christian Aleverti (National Swiss Library, CATS), Sandy Roe (Cataloging and Classification Quarterly), Gordana Mazic (IZUM, UNIMARC)

1. Welcome and introductions

Rehab Ouf welcomed the observers and the members present and the members joining online via Zoom and proposed to have a 90 min. meeting instead of 2 hours as planned, to give present members and observers 30 min before the IFLA WLIC 2022 closing ceremony. The attendees presented themselves.

2. Agenda

A motion to postpone items no. 8 (Matters arising from past minutes and past meetings), no. 9 (ISBD RG projects (continuing, discontinuing and new) and no. 11 (Reports from liaisons and other standards groups) for a 90 min meeting, to BM II to take place virtually, was passed by the chair and seconded by all members. Agenda was approved with this change.

3. Approval of minutes of past meetings

The following minutes of past meetings were approved without amendments.

3.1. WLIC 2021 BM I (9 August 2021, virtual)

3.2. ISBD RG Midyear meeting and BM II (28 March 2022, virtual)

3.3. Pre-WLIC 2022 meeting (24 June 2022, virtual)

4. ISBD RG membership

Rehab reminded that the ISBD RG had a late settlement following IFLA 2021 elections, due to a different timeline than sections and 2 rounds of selections. The procedures for co-opting expert advisors and those of members for geographic diversity for the RGs are not yet decided by IFLA HQ and the GB following the new governance. The Advisory Committee on Standards (CoS) shall put the terms of reference for co-opting expert advisors to the RGs.

Pat Riva, Cos Secretary, reported that this was on the agenda of CoS meeting on Monday, but CoS Chair was not able to consider it for it was added few days preceding the meeting. Pat added that Victoria Owen, CoS Chair, thinks that co-opting expert advisors is a matter for CoS to consider as a general topic, not for special cases, and accordingly terms of reference are to be developed. This will be a matter to arise in the next CoS meeting that will be virtually held sometimes in September.

Rehab Ouf informed the meeting that the ISBD RG may have a resignation among the appointed members, not confirmed yet, due to change of institution. She said that Megan Price, IFLA Professional Support Officer, was consulted about if filling out casual vacancies for RGs has the same procedures as in Sections SCs.

5. Chair's update

5.1. Chair's report

Rehab Ouf gave a short report about the ISBD RG activities and the tasks in which she was involved during the past year as Chair of the ISBD RG.

ISBD RG activities

1. The ISBD RG had an open session titled "*ISBD in Transition*" in the virtual WLIC 2021, it was successful despite the overlap with a joint session between the Bibliography and the Subject Analysis and Access Sections.
2. An article by the Chair was contributed to the December 2021 issue of IFLA Metadata Newsletter, accounting for the RG activities and the revision development during 2021, for the third year in a row.
3. The ISBD RG had 3 business meetings (listed in Item 3 of the agenda) and an ad-hoc meeting about print standards with IFLA HQ (Helen Mandl, Deputy Secretary General and Megan Price, IFLA Professional Support Officer) that was run as a panel discussion around the topic.
4. The ISBD RG has officially published [the 2021 Update of the ISBD Consolidated edition](#) of 2011 on 24 May 2022, after its release as a [Draft](#) in December 2021. Upon publishing, the RG received 2 requests to translate it into Spanish and into Italian.
5. The ISBD RG arranged a closed meeting in this congress for decision making about ISBDM (see details in Item 6.2)
6. Concerning coordination and the work done with other IFLA's committees and groups, the ISBD RG has revised the ISBD vocabulary on MulDiCat through a 2 step-review process by a dedicated task group chaired by Elena Escolano and with as liaison Ricardo Santos, member of MulDiCat WG, then the Review Group.

ISBD RG and related IFLA's units

7. With *LIDATEC*, the ISBD RG Chair has been working on a "policy document" for the IFLA Namespaces tackling the presentation and maintenance of the namespaces. This document was, as proposed by Pat Riva, commented in *LIDATEC*'s business meeting during the congress. It is hoped that it will then pass to CoS for endorsement so it can be applied. Pat Riva added that this is an important document that needs to be adopted by CoS. The document had a number of suggestions about wordings and ordering of items, but it covers the issues that need to be covered in a policy document and it will be put on the agenda for the CoS next meeting.
8. In the *Advisory Committee on Standards*, we got an initiative by the Cataloguing Section. The Chair expressed on behalf of the ISBD RG the interest of the Review Group to join this initiative if a working group is to be established. Talking about the documents proposed to CoS, Vincent Boulet, Chair of CATS, said that these are to express the concern about the integration of IFLA bibliographic standards. The aim is also to bring the Review Groups and metadata sections to work together. We proposed to CoS to have a transitory WG composed of representatives of RGs and metadata sections and to have some results by the IFLA congress next year. Rehab commented that these are two strategic and forward-thinking initiatives. Also bringing the RGs and the metadata sections together will be mutually beneficial.

5.2. Updates from COS, IFLA HQ, GB

Rehab observed that all ISBD RG and CoS meetings were parallel to important meetings arranged by IFLA HQ like the “Officers’ Briefing” and the “Out in the Open” session reporting about what has been taking place in IFLA lately and the GB response to it, making it difficult for her to attend to update the members about these meetings.

Ricardo Santos informed the meeting about the topics discussed in the officers’ briefing session: the functions and way of working of WGs and SIGs; the latter needs to be more formal running through elections. A two year lifecycle for WGs is proposed, after which period it either becomes a SIG or be dismissed. Also was discussed how to make the next year elections more organized and ready ahead of time than in 2021. A revision by the PC for every unit will be put in place to ensure their relevance and efficiency.

Caroline Saccucci., SAA SA Secretary, informed the meeting about preliminary discussions trying to define the concept of Working Group in the general IFLA’s structure in the new governance vs. that of working groups as informal structure within IFLA units. She also informed the meeting about the new Networks concept with the idea of having a cross-sections collaboration on projects or areas of shared interest.

6. Development of the Standard: ISBD Revisions

6.1. 2021 Update of the ISBD and activities of the Content Update Task Force

Judit Fejes read the project concluding report of the Content Update Task Force that produced the *2021 Update* prepared by Elena Escolano, Chair of the Task Force.

Elena Escolano (joining online) thanked the members of the Content Update Task Force for their efforts that led to this achievement. Rehab thanked the members of the Content Update Task Force whose expertise and hard work led to having the *2021 Update*, the first edition after 11 years since the Consolidated Ed. of 2011. Special mentions were made to liaisons from the IFLA Rare Books and Special Collections Section who partnered with the ISBD RG in this *Update*, Adelaida Caro and Isabel-Garcia Monge who is present in this meeting.

6.2. ISBD for Manifestation (ISBDM), and activities of the Manifestation Task Force

Renate Behrens, Chair of the ISBD for Manifestation Task Force, said that the task force has reached some goals in this revision aligning the ISBD to IFLA LRM, after 3 years of work. This includes analysis a list of basic decisions, recommendations for publication and a ISBDM element set covering about 60% of the ISBDM elements.

The basic decisions by the Manifestation Task Force were accepted in the hybrid closed meeting that took place in this WLIC 2022, between the members of the ISBD Review Group. With this approval the TF can go ahead as planned, which will be: a final ISBDM draft in Spring next year for the ISBD RG; then, if matters work well, a final draft for a worldwide review around WLIC 2023, then for the Advisory Committee on Standards for approval by the end of 2023, and finally to have a publication in 2024.

7. ISBD vocabularies and IFLA standards namespace

Rehab said that she reported about the work on Namespaces policy document with LIDATEC in Item no. 5.1 Chair’s report. She said that the newly introduced elements in the *2021 Update* should be on ISBD vocabulary namespaces, following the approval by CoS of

the policy document setting out the parameters concerning the versioning and the naming of versions, minor, major or patch, since the Namespaces are mainly directed to the developers.

8. Matters arising from past minutes and past meetings

Item 8 and sub-items were postponed to BM II.

9. ISBD RG projects (continuing, discontinuing and new)

Item no. 9 was postponed to BM II.

10. Action Plan 2021 – 2023, progress

Rehab presented and briefed the filled form of the ISBD RG [Action Plan 2021-2023](#), concluding that despite the challenging actions and activities in all fields of action, the ISBD RG has achieved them and is on track for accomplishing its action plan.

For their special roles and mandates within and outside IFLA, CoS and the RGs have a different template for their action plans not working through action areas like the Sections, but structured into 3 sections: 1. Self-contained projects, 2. Engagement with global processes, 3. Issue monitoring, introduced by a section 0. Context, outlining their purpose.

11. Reports from liaisons and other standards groups

Despite the motion at the beginning of the meeting to postpone item no. 9 to BM II, the time remaining in the meeting allowed for some reporting from present members and liaisons.

1. RDA Steering Committee, Renate Behrens: the main issue on the RSC agenda now through the next years is internationalization, noting that RSC has representatives in Europe but not in Africa and Asia. After the 3R phase is coming the consolidation phase for many communities which have to adapt their local needs to the new RDA Toolkit. The review phase is up now again after the freeze period, the procedures to send proposals to the RSC are noted on the website.
2. ISSN International Centre, Mikael Watterstrom: Mikael briefed the attached report. (Annex 2)
3. IFLA RBSCS, Isabel Garcia-Monge: RBSCS established a new metadata working group for the cataloguing of special materials. The Section had a Talking Stick session in this WLIC 2022 which discussed few interesting issues including the proposal for the international legislation and unique persistent identifiers for manuscripts items as objects.

The meeting was adjourned.

ISBD Content Update Task Force report to the ISBD Review Group

2022/07/28

MEMBERS:

Elena Escolano Rodriguez (Chair)

Judit Fejes

Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (Consultant, Music Materials)

Dorothy McGarry

Rehab Ouf

Ricardo Santos Muñoz

Hollie White

Adelaida Caro Martín (previous Rare Books and Special Collections Section liaison)

Isabel Garcia-Monge Carretero (current Rare Books and Special Collections Section liaison)

The Task Force was officially established in 2019 November 21st with the challenge of updating the content of Consolidated ISBD 2011, due for 2021 as established by the ISBD Review Group in its Terms of Reference.

The release of the 2021 Update to the 2011 Consolidated Edition of the ISBD in 25th of May, 2022 (<https://repository.ifa.org/handle/123456789/1939>) is the result of two years of intensive work by the Content Update Task Force. Consequently, it can be considered that the Task force has met the schedule and goals established by the ISBD Review Group.

CONTENT OF THE UPDATE

Among the main modifications are:

The content of the ISBD has been extended to include unpublished resources of any kind, especially manuscripts. The ISBD, therefore, is no longer a standard only for published resources. The scope of this extension was agreed on during the ISBD Review Group meeting in Lyon in 2011

The ISBD as an international standard provides internationally agreed on stipulations for the different granularity needed by different types of libraries. This is the reason that there are general stipulations and specific ones in the ISBD, to make the descriptions compatible. Including unpublished resources has resulted in the need to add specific stipulations for this type of resource under the general ones. Some adjustments to other parts of the ISBD and some new elements have also been needed, for example, the new element Production process in Area 0 to facilitate categorization and retrieval; the new element Unpublished statement in area 3; and the extension of area 2 to cover the typology of unpublished resources.

The revision of cartographic resources has clarified stipulations and distinguished elements already existing in the Consolidated ISBD concerning the description of

celestial cartographic resources. It was necessary to move some of the elements into Area 3 that were in notes before. In addition, some more notes have been added for a more in-depth description of this kind of resource. These changes have resulted in the reorganization of Area 3 for more consistency and to provide for the same treatment of all types of cartographic resources

The ISBD is a standard that allows for different levels of granularity in description. Stipulations for description of component parts have been added to the Consolidated ISBD to standardize the practice, allowing for the application of different levels of granular description of component parts in the same catalogue. The structure of this description that had been dealt with in chapter A, includes stipulations: to describe the part itself, to identify the host resource in which it is contained and to provide details on the exact location of the part within the host, with the linking element connecting the two descriptions.

The table of contents, Appendix A and the final Index were revised.

DELIVERABLES:

According to the ISBD New Revision Plan and Terms of Reference 2019-11-21 the Task Force had to prepare the revision of the standard, and a document indicating all of the modifications that have taken place.

Decision was made by the Task Force to deal with both objectives indicating the modifications in the full document. It was decided to indicate the modifications in red, to draw the attention of the reader quickly to the changes introduced.

Among the copyedits requested to be made by Headquarters in March 14th, 2022, in order to be published was that text colour should be black with no red.

Is for this reason, that the decision made on keep a text indicating the modifications was not maintained and the final text published is in accordance with the above requests.

TRAINING MATERIAL

The Task Force also updated the *Full ISBD Examples* document, update 2021, working since March 2021 collecting different examples from many colleagues representing different countries and languages for promotion purposes and to support the implementation of the new version.

It was sent to the ISBD RG chair on April 12, 2022, to be published jointly with the updating of the standard.

With this last document, the Task Force considered has accomplished with the accepted charges for the Task Force of updating the Consolidated ISBD and the deliverable training material.

RECENT WORK

In April 7th, 2022 the Task Force, virtually met to discuss the ISBD Review Group Draft action plan 2021-2023.

PROMOTION

News about the release of the 2021 Update to the ISBD 2011 Consolidated Edition has been publicized on IFLA's website and IFLA's relevant mailing lists (<https://www.ifla.org/es/news/release-of-the-2021-update-to-the-2011-consolidated-edition-of-the-isbd/>).

It was advertised in IFLA Metadata Newsletter.

Kindly, Jay Weitz announced in OCLC distribution list thank and also in a about a dozen cataloging-related discussion lists.

Presentations have been made:

Update of ISBD: fulfilling the needs of communities of users, at the WLIC2021 ISBD in Transition program, on August 2021 August 18th.

ISBD: Actualización y transformación, presentation at the Cuarto Coloquio sobre RDA en América Latina y el Caribe “Innovaciones en la RDA e implicancias para su implementación en las bibliotecas de América Latina y el Caribe”, October 27 – 29th

Article: Escolano Rodríguez, E. (2022). The Updating of ISBD and its transformation. *JLIS.It*, 13(2), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.36253/jlis.it-448>

TRANSLATIONS

The translations to the following language are on course

- Italian
- Spanish

NEXT STEPS:

The Task Force has met its charges at large and now can be disbanded.

If the ISBD RG do not consider this suggestion feasible, the chair of the Task Force recommend the Review Group to select among the members another person to take the responsibility of chairing the group.

As chair of the Task Force, I only can stress my big thanks to the members of the Task Force for their constant work during these past years and good answer to my busy work schedules. The Task Force has made much more than was charged when it was established and has accomplished the objectives.

Elena Escolano Rodríguez
Content Update Task Force, chair

ANNEX 2



ISSN Liaison report to the ISBD Review Group

ISBD Review Group business meeting, Dublin July 28, 2022

The ISSN International Centre continued its activities despite the still problematic health situation in 2021. The ISSN IC staff worked mainly remotely until the end of August 2021 and partially thereafter. Weekly coordination meetings helped to maintain a good team spirit and move key projects forward.

Three new ISSN National Centres in 2021

The ISSN International Centre planned and implemented the opening of three new national centres at the Ivan Fedorov Book Chamber of Ukraine, the Hauptverband des Österreichischen Buchhandels in Austria, and the Biblioteca Nacional del Perú, raising the total number of ISSN National Centres to 93. All meetings, training, and press conferences were done remotely, as were all large Network meetings in 2021. The opening of three national centres in the same year is quite exceptional and proves the dynamism of the ISSN Network.

The 2020-2024 Strategy

In the second year of the 2020-2024 ISSN IC Strategic Plan, much progress was achieved on the various objectives as described below:

***Develop the global interoperability of the ISSN Portal by improving the management of ISNIs within the ISSN Portal:**

-An internal wiki was set up to identify about 300 multinational publishers, their affiliated publishers and related brands that populate the ISSN database. ISSN International Centre extracted data regarding 50 publishers with no ISNIs to run a batch test with OCLC, which manages the ISNI database. Before a formal metadata exchange process can be established, it is necessary to work on the ISNI data model for this type of organization.

***Encourage the creation of new ISSN National Centres to extend the ISSN Network worldwide:**

-It was an exceptional year for three National Centres to open.

***Implement the sixth version of the ISSN standard by creating the family ISSN and other cluster ISSNs:**

-The ISSN Review Group explored the possibilities of new cluster ISSNs. The Family ISSN concept was distilled to a plan for the Title History ISSN, ISSN-H, an identifier that will group the successive titles held by a publication over time. The ISSN International Centre submitted a MARC Advisory Committee (MAC) discussion paper¹ in May 2021 for the creation of a repeatable new tag for cluster ISSNs, the 023, so that a URI subfield in \$0 or \$1 would be unambiguous from that in the 022, where the cluster ISSN-L is currently encoded. A proposal is planned to be submitted to MAC in November 2022.

***Implement the sixth version of ISO3297 - ISSN by assigning ISSN to various types of continuing resources:**

-An ISSN proposal was passed by the MARC Advisory Committee in January 2021 to include additional types of continuing resources defined for the control field (tag 008 position 21) to reflect the full scope of continuing resources covered by ISO 3297:2020. Three code definitions were revised, and six new codes were added. A change request for the equivalent codes for UNIMARC followed suit in April, and by Fall 2021, the new codes were officially published in both schemes.

***Develop interoperability of the ISSN Portal through the management of persistent identifiers and URLs of digital continuing resources:**

-In conjunction with the National Library of Finland, a discussion paper² was submitted to the MARC Advisory Committee (MAC) in December 2021, entitled Enrichment of Web Archive Information in Field 856 in the MARC 21 Formats. The goal is to redefine some of the subfields to track archiving information and persistent identifiers (PIDs) and find a solution to link

1 <https://www.loc.gov/marc/mac/2021/2021-dp07.html>

2 <https://www.loc.gov/marc/mac/2022/2022-dp02.html>

<https://www.loc.gov/marc/mac/2022/2022-dp06.html>

<https://www.loc.gov/marc/mac/2022/2022-dp08.html>



rot and content drift. At the MAC annual meeting in June 2022, the Proposal No. 2022-08 for redefined 856 subfields (\$h for broken URLs, and \$g for PIDs, and a new definition of \$q Electronic format type) was passed, and it was accepted that the Discussion Paper No. 2022-DP06 be submitted in November 2022 as a proposal to create a new field 857 for Electronic Archive Location and Access.

***Promote and develop Keepers Registry to associate new agencies and increase the number of identified archived resources:**

-Three new agencies have signed a memorandum of understanding with ISSN International Centre in 2021: the Bibliothèque nationale de France for Gallica data, the California Digital Library for Merritt Repository data and the Internet Archive for Fatcat data. Keepers Registry is also a partner of DOAJ, CLOCKSS, Internet Archive and Public Knowledge Project in the JASPER project, which aims to reduce the number of unarchived open access journals.

Standard Reviews

As the registration authority for ISO 3297, the ISSN International Centre is closely involved in the revision process of the standard, which has evolved considerably since 2015. The sixth edition of ISO 3297 standard was made available to the public in October 2020. A minor revision was voted in 2021 to introduce editorial amendments. The final vote took place in May 2022 and the Final Draft International Standard was approved. Publication will ensue in 2022.

The ISSN Manual revision by the ISSN Review Group is ongoing. The project team now meets on a bi-weekly basis. In parallel, two staff of the ISSN International Centre represent ISSN interests in other standard reviews, notably the ongoing ISBD revision, and on the IFLA Advisory Committee on Standards.

Key numbers

There is a significant decrease in the number of records produced in 2021 by the ISSN Network compared to 2020, returning to the production volume of 2019. This may be the consequence of national centres having still to deal with difficult sanitary circumstances, and less retrospective cataloguing projects. The ISSN International Centre contributed 2,588 new ISSN to the database in 2021 and carried on with several projects to improve data quality with partner services such as DOAJ and Latindex, as well as with publishers such as Springer.

- 176,930 new and updated records from National Centres
- 2,588 ISSN assigned by ISSN IC
- 6,094 OA records added to ROAD
- 16,021 Keepers records added
- 790 CIDEMIS requests processed.

ISSN+, the new global cataloguing tool for the ISSN Network

The full development of ISSN+ was delayed by the difficult pandemic context. However, ISSN+ was launched successfully 27 June 2022 and is now the operational cataloguing tool for the ISSN Network.

Respectfully submitted by

Mikael Wetterstrom
Metadata and Technical Coordination of the ISSN Network, ISSN International Centre
July 2022